

**IN THE CIRCUIT COURT OF THE ELEVENTH JUDICIAL
CIRCUIT IN AND FOR MIAMI-DADE COUNTY, FLORIDA**

CASE NO: 2022-002742-CA-01

SECTION: CA44

JUDGE: Lisa Walsh

CRYSTAL CRUISES LLC

Plaintiff(s)

vs.

MARK C HEALY

Defendant(s)

**ORDER SUSTAINING, IN PART, ASSIGNEE'S NINTH OMNIBUS OBJECTION TO
CONSUMER CLAIMS [ECF 296]**

THIS MATTER came before the Court upon the *Assignee's Ninth Omnibus Objection to Claims* [ECF 296] (the "Objection") filed on April 10, 2023, by Mark C. Healy (the "Assignee"), solely in his capacity as the Assignee for the benefit of creditors of Crystal Cruises, LLC, Crystal Holdings U.S., LLC, and Crystal AirCruises, LLC (collectively, the "Assignors"). The Court, having reviewed the Objection and the record in this case, finding that notice of the Objection was sufficient and properly served on interested parties pursuant to the Court's *Order Granting Assignee's Motion for Entry of an Order Approving Procedures for Objections to Consumer and Employee Claims* [ECF 257] (the "Claims Procedure Order"), noting that no dispute to the Objection from any claimant listed on the attached **Exhibit 1** was received by the Assignee or filed within the 21-day period set forth in the Objection and the Claims Procedure Order, finding that the relief requested in the Objection is in the best interests of the Assignors' estates, and otherwise finding that good and sufficient cause exists for granting the relief set forth herein, does hereby

ORDER AND ADJUDGE that:

1. The Objection is **SUSTAINED** as to each of the proofs of claim identified on **Exhibit 1**

attached to this Order.

2. Each of the proofs of claim identified on **Exhibit 1** attached to this Order is treated as set forth in **Exhibit 1**.
3. This Order has no res judicata, estoppel, or other effect on the validity, allowance, or disallowance of any proof of claim identified in the Objection that is not listed on **Exhibit 1** attached to this Order.
4. The Assignee is authorized to take all actions necessary or appropriate to give effect to this Order.
5. The terms, conditions, and provisions of this Order shall be immediately effective and enforceable upon entry hereof.
6. The Court shall retain jurisdiction to resolve any dispute arising from or relating to this Order.

DONE and **ORDERED** in Chambers at Miami-Dade County, Florida on this 18th day of July, 2023.

2022-002742-CA-01 07-18-2023 11:43 AM


2022-002742-CA-01 07-18-2023 11:43 AM

Hon. Lisa Walsh

CIRCUIT COURT JUDGE

Electronically Signed

No Further Judicial Action Required on **THIS MOTION**

CLERK TO **RECLOSE** CASE IF POST JUDGMENT

Electronically Served:

Albert J Vitto III, vitto@sl-law.com

Amber Donner, amber.donner@spectorrubin.com
Amber Donner, amber_donner@hotmail.com
Ana Hesny, ah@assoulineberlowe.com
Ana Hesny, ena@assoulineberlowe.com
Angela M. Swenka, Swenka@litchfieldcavo.com
Angela M. Swenka, hudson@litchfieldcavo.com
Ari Newman, newmanar@gtlaw.com
Ari Newman, perezan@gtlaw.com
Benjamin Katz, bkatz@fbtlaw.com
Benjamin Katz, awebb@fbtlaw.com
Benjamin Katz, adragoo@fbtlaw.com
Carol Finklehoffe, cfinklehoffe@lipcon.com
Carol Finklehoffe, smatus@lipcon.com
Carol Finklehoffe, mwinkleman@lipcon.com
Carol L. Finklehoffe, cfinklehoffe@lipcon.com
Carol L. Finklehoffe, smatus@lipcon.com
Carol L. Finklehoffe, ydelgado@lipcon.com
Christian Merida, christian@miamimaritimelaw.co
Dania Slim, dania.slim@pillsburylaw.com
Daniel Grammes, dgrammes@lipcon.com
Daniel Grammes, danielgrammes01@gmail.com
Daniel Grammes, myopez@lipcon.com
Daniel Robertson, robertson.daniel@pbgc.gov
Daniel Robertson, efile@pbgc.gov
Daniel Y Gielchinsky, dan@dgimlaw.com
Daniel Y Gielchinsky, eservice@dgimlaw.com
Daniel Y Gielchinsky, dan_1836@ecf.courtdrive.com
Dmitriy Pavlovich Shapovalov, stron124@gmail.com
Dmitriy Pavlovich Shapovalov, lawyer@mcruiises.ru
Donald R Kirk, dkirk@carltonfields.com
Donald R Kirk, kathompson@carltonfields.com
Donald R Kirk, nmihara@carltonfields.com
Eric S Rein, rrein@hmbllaw.com
Eric S Rein, ecfnofices@hmbllaw.com
Eric S Rein, ahammer@hmbllaw.com
Gary I. Khutorsky, gkhutorsky@hinshawlaw.com
Gary I. Khutorsky, DPhangSang@hinshawlaw.com
Gary M Freedman, gary.freedman@nelsonmullins.com
Gary M Freedman, sarah.castillo@nelsonmullins.com
Gary M Freedman, francis.santelices@nelsonmullins.com
Ilyse M. Homer, ihomer@bergersingerman.com
Ilyse M. Homer, asanchez@bergersingerman.com
Ilyse M. Homer, drt@bergersingerman.com
Isaac Marcushamer, isaac@dgimlaw.com
Isaac Marcushamer, isaac@dgimlaw.com
Isaac Marcushamer, isaac@dgimlaw.com
James N. Hurley, jhurley@fowler-white.com

James N. Hurley, vkhonsary@fowler-white.com
Jason Klein, jklein@bsklawyers.com
Jason Klein, rbalesjr@bsklawyers.com
Jason P. Stearns, jstearns@sgrlaw.com
Jason P. Stearns, ckitchell@sgrlaw.com
Jason P. Stearns, daigotti@sgrlaw.com
Jason Paul Stearns, jstearns@sgrlaw.com
Jason Paul Stearns, ckitchell@sgrlaw.com
Javiera B. Sundar, sundar@litchfieldcavo.com
John R. Catizone, catizone@litchfieldcavo.com
John R. Catizone, hudson@litchfieldcavo.com
Jonathan Groth, jonathan@dgimlaw.com
Jonathan Groth, colleen@dgimlaw.com
Jonathan Groth, eservice@dgimlaw.com
Jonathan Klein, jklein@mayerbrown.com
Jonathan Klein, jklein@jd16.law.harvard.edu
Jonathan Klein, WDC-DEPT-Docket@mayerbrown.com
Joseph Pack, joe@packlaw.com
Joseph Pack, jessey@packlaw.com
Joseph Pack, info@packlaw.com
Lara R Fernandez, lfernandez@trenam.com
Lara R Fernandez, mmosbach@trenam.com
Lara R Fernandez, mwoods@trenam.com
Leyza F. Blanco, lblanco@sequorlaw.com
Leyza F. Blanco, jdiaz@sequorlaw.com
Luis Alexander Perez, aperez@lipcon.com
Luis Alexander Perez, myepez@lipcon.com
Luis Salazar, Luis@Salazar.Law
Luis Salazar, Lee-Sin@Salazar.Law
Luis Salazar, Eservice@Salazar.Law
Manuel Francisco Valdes, mvaldes@landandsealaw.net
Manuel Francisco Valdes, admin@miamimaritimelaw.co
Mark Raymond, mark.raymond@nelsonmullins.com
Mark Raymond, stacy.smith@nelsonmullins.com
Matthew W Peaire, mpeaire@butler.legal
Matthew W Peaire, lalario@butler.legal
Matthew W Peaire, mgreen@butler.legal
Megan W Murray, mmurray@underwoodmurray.com
Megan W Murray, mmurray@ecf.courtdrive.com
Megan W Murray, dstrand@underwoodmurray.com
Michael A. Nardella, mnardella@nardellalaw.com
Michael A. Nardella, pmascia@nardellalaw.com
Michael A. Nardella, kcooper@nardellalaw.com
Michael Baird, baird.michael@pbgc.gov
Michael Baird, efile@pbgc.gov
Michael D. Lessne, michael@lessne.law
Michael T Landen, mlanden@klugerkaplan.com

Michael T Landen, mmathis@klugerkaplan.com
Michelle Otero Valdes, mov@miamimaritimelaw.co
Michelle Otero Valdes, mov@miamimaritimelaw.co
Michelle Otero Valdes, admin@miamimaritimelaw.co
Mitchell W. Mandler, mmandler@smgqlaw.com
Mitchell W. Mandler, xmiranda@smgqlaw.com
Mitchell W. Mandler, rwilliams@smgqlaw.com
Morgan Benjamin Edelboim, morgan@elrolaw.com
Morgan Benjamin Edelboim, eservice@elrolaw.com
Morgan Benjamin Edelboim, tisha@elrolaw.com
Morgan Spector, spector@litchfieldcavo.com
Paul N Mascia, pmascia@nardellalaw.com
Paul N Mascia, kcooper@nardellalaw.com
Paul S Singerman, singerman@bergersingerman.com
Paul S Singerman, efile@ecf.courtdrive.com
Paul S Singerman, DRT@bergersingerman.com
Paul S Singerman, singerman@bergersingerman.com
Paul S Singerman, mdiaz@bergersingerman.com
Paul S Singerman, efile@bergersingerman.com
Robert Menzies, robert.menzies@fisherbroyles.com
Robert Menzies, barbara.abel@fisherbroyles.com
Samuel Jason Capuano, scapuano@bergersingerman.com
Samuel Jason Capuano, efile@bergersingerman.com
Samuel Jason Capuano, fsellers@bergersingerman.com
Spencer Wellborn, spencer.wellborn@spectorrubin.com
Spencer Wellborn, amber.donner@spectorrubin.com
Spencer Wellborn, andrea.samper@spectorrubin.com
Stephen Charles Breuer, stephen@breuer.law
Stephen Charles Breuer, genna@breuer.law
Thomas M. Messana, tmessana@underwoodmurray.com
Thomas M. Messana, tmessana@ecf.courtdrive.com
Thomas M. Messana, dstrand@underwoodmurray.com

Physically Served:

| REFERENCE | CLAIMANT NAME(S) | CLAIM NUMBER | SUBMITTED CLAIM AMOUNT | GROUNDS FOR OBJECTION | TREATMENT OF CLAIM | CONSUMER PRIORITY AMOUNT | GENERAL UNSECURED AMOUNT |
|---------------|--------------------------------|--------------|------------------------|---|--------------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Alvin & Karyn Unger | C7744 | \$ 1,814.70 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Azman Lim & Victor Lim Kok Eow | C10797 | \$ 6,552.50 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Beverly Enewold | C3651 | \$ 5,136.45 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Cory Unger & Alicia Unger | C7747 | \$ 1,379.70 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Cristina Patricia Fong | C4171 | \$ 874.20 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Dalany Unger | C7750 | \$ 1,424.70 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | David & Cheryl Bieber | C7482 | \$ 6,801.00 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Elaine Hepburn | C3802 | \$ 7,308.00 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Eric tang & Janet May Tang | C4031 | \$ 1,048.20 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | FRANK TONIN | C11020 | \$ 613.35 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Ivan Deibert & Cecile Deibert | C940 | \$ 1,318.20 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | James Biddlecombe | C7748 | \$ 1,912.20 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Joan Davis | C7348 | \$ 22,205.70 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | John D Herrick | C304 | \$ 5,225.00 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Karen & Stuart Morgan | C9963 | \$ 1,817.40 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Leisa & Kate Makin | C9398 | \$ 1,578.82 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Lillian & Kwok keung Chung | C2569 | \$ 1,531.20 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Linda Ciszek | C568 | \$ 6,302.10 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | McKenna Unger | C7749 | \$ 953.85 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Michele Parker | C10933 | \$ 15,477.68 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Nixon & Boston Unger | C7746 | \$ 1,379.70 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Paola Biagi | C9234 | \$ 631.35 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Paul Unger & Cheryl Unger | C7745 | \$ 1,439.70 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Priscilla Chan & Rodic Chan | C2562 | \$ 1,936.20 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |

EXHIBIT 1

| REFERENCE | CLAIMANT NAME(S) | CLAIM NUMBER | SUBMITTED CLAIM AMOUNT | GROUNDS FOR OBJECTION | TREATMENT OF CLAIM | CONSUMER PRIORITY AMOUNT | GENERAL UNSECURED AMOUNT |
|---------------|------------------------------|--------------|------------------------|---|--------------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Priscilla Maningo | C908 | \$ 364.95 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Rebecca A. Yoch | C10193 | \$ 4,428.00 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Rebecca A. Yoch | C10194 | \$ 7,790.00 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Richard Lefebvre | C6786 | \$ 3,859.20 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Richard Lefebvre | C6787 | \$ 11,204.70 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Richard S Basuk | C367 | \$ 4,786.40 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | RITA LAI PING LEUNG | C6256 | \$ 582.15 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | ROBERT & FRANCES BEAN | C11215 | \$ 15,107.35 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Robert Cuccias | C4637 | \$ 13,322.70 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Robert Mankey & Holly Mankey | C1052 | \$ 1,481.40 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Robyn C Hutchinson | C854 | \$ 9,074.00 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Robyn C Hutchinson | C855 | \$ 1,466.70 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | RON BERGER | C104 | \$ 6,992.70 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Russell Knox & Gina Knox | C276 | \$ 8,530.00 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Sam Soontung Hsieh | C1938 | \$ 2,087.70 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Sampson Lung | C9470 | \$ 1,706.85 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Sandra & Gail Mulhollam | C6394 | \$ 1,246.20 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Sandra Rosen & Leonard Adams | C8378 | \$ 1,744.80 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Sandy Ira Allan Bigman | C911 | \$ 2,552.70 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Scott J Uroff | C1828 | \$ 15,156.60 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Scott J Uroff | C1829 | \$ 14,498.70 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Scott Prince | C9246 | \$ 1,471.20 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Se Yao Hsu | C6728 | \$ 920.70 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | SHANG BIN LU | C6608 | \$ 2,026.20 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |

EXHIBIT 1

| REFERENCE | CLAIMANT NAME(S) | CLAIM NUMBER | SUBMITTED CLAIM AMOUNT | GROUNDS FOR OBJECTION | TREATMENT OF CLAIM | CONSUMER PRIORITY AMOUNT | GENERAL UNSECURED AMOUNT |
|---------------|-----------------------------|--------------|------------------------|---|--------------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|
| OOBJ23.04-01C | SHANG BIN LU | C6611 | \$ 2,026.20 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | SHANG BIN LU | C6619 | \$ 2,026.20 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Shari Westerfield | C5853 | \$ 12,020.00 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Sharlene Garish | C1966 | \$ 1,070.00 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Sharon Kinkaid | C1440 | \$ 6,028.00 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Sheree Tai | C3583 | \$ 455.40 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Sheryl Lynn Stephens | C6399 | \$ 1,548.90 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Shinlei Schlaff | C7226 | \$ 2,162.70 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Shirley Tan | C1776 | \$ 965.85 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Shui & Po Ching Lee | C6905 | \$ 1,363.20 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Sik Kwan Fung | C6582 | \$ 6,944.70 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Sir Brian Keith | C2654 | \$ 11,338.00 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Stanley & Linda F Blend | C1296 | \$ 10,416.00 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Stephanie & George Erbrecht | C1713 | \$ 13,894.30 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Stephanie Splane | C1204 | \$ 2,872.35 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Stephen Brener | C3215 | \$ 2,504.00 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Stephen Moore | C5430 | \$ 1,656.90 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Stephen Parker | C10932 | \$ 15,477.68 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Stephen Pennell | C2146 | \$ 383.80 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Stephen Pennell | C2147 | \$ 13,165.70 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Stephen Pennell | C2148 | \$ 1,890.00 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Steve T. & Grace L. Chin | C3248 | \$ 9,387.80 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Steve T. & Grace L. Chin | C3249 | \$ 1,623.00 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Steve T. & Grace L. Chin | C3250 | \$ 2,102.50 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |

EXHIBIT 1

| REFERENCE | CLAIMANT NAME(S) | CLAIM NUMBER | SUBMITTED CLAIM AMOUNT | GROUNDS FOR OBJECTION | TREATMENT OF CLAIM | CONSUMER PRIORITY AMOUNT | GENERAL UNSECURED AMOUNT |
|---------------|-------------------------------------|--------------|------------------------|---|--------------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Steve T. & Grace L. Chin | C3251 | \$ 1,539.60 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Steve T. & Grace L. Chin | C3252 | \$ 200.00 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Sundararajann & Rema Dhamotharan | C205 | \$ 4,582.00 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Susan Angel | C6017 | \$ 642.82 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Susan Angel | C6018 | \$ 300.00 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Susan Johnson | C10906 | \$ 27,904.00 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Theresa Mon Lee | C1964 | \$ 721.35 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Thomas L Houts | C4479 | \$ 400.00 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Thomas Peterson | C2134 | \$ 4,947.75 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Thomas Tescri | C3064 | \$ 1,642.20 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Timothy M Stull & Michele D Stull | C160 | \$ 23,439.60 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Tommy Wing Keung Tao & Marian Leung | C8537 | \$ 1,086.60 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Virginia Castellano | C9097 | \$ 616.35 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Warren E. Stinson | C3043 | \$ 869.85 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | William & Betty Schultz | C10063 | \$ 8,642.10 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | William & Betty Schultz | C10064 | \$ 35,564.70 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | William Carpenter | C6741 | \$ 2,301.90 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | William Gendron | C6799 | \$ 29,189.90 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | William Kleinhofer | C7098 | \$ 15,250.26 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | William Kleinhofer | C7099 | \$ 10,932.60 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Yasmin Rahmani-Dugan | C3194 | \$ 12,800.00 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Yin Mai Lo | C10667 | \$ 721.35 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Yuk Chun Maria Hon | C8714 | \$ 354.30 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Yuk Hing Leung & Miranda Tsang | C1595 | \$ 1,591.20 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |

EXHIBIT 1

| REFERENCE | CLAIMANT NAME(S) | CLAIM NUMBER | SUBMITTED CLAIM AMOUNT | GROUNDS FOR OBJECTION | TREATMENT OF CLAIM | CONSUMER PRIORITY AMOUNT | GENERAL UNSECURED AMOUNT |
|---------------|----------------------|--------------|------------------------|---|--------------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|
| OOBJ23.04-01C | Zeev & Cohava Zahavi | C2236 | \$ 984.52 | CLAIMANT HAS BEEN COMPENSATED IN FULL BY CREDIT CARD COMPANY (VISA OR MASTERCARD) | DISALLOW AND EXPUNGE IN ITS ENTIRETY | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |